

MIT OpenCourseWare
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

24.02 Moral Problems and the Good Life
Fall 2008

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.

Second Argument Analysis Exercise

Write 2-3 pages providing an analysis of the following argument (written by your TAs based on some of our recent readings).

- Number the premises and the conclusion. Articulate each premise and the conclusion in no more than one sentence. Feel free to use a different wording in your statement of the premises and conclusion than is provided by the text. You may not need to use every sentence in the passage in reconstructing the argument, and you may need to supply premises that are not explicitly stated in the text given.
- Indicate for each premise whether it is an assumption, or whether it is supposed to follow from earlier premises. (This should appear in parentheses after the premise.)
- After stating the argument, briefly explain it in your own words, and then comment on its cogency: Are its premises plausible? Are the inferences sound? (If not, why not?)

It's clearly wrong to torture puppies for no reason, even if it's fun. Why? Because it's wrong to cause a conscious being great suffering and pain for no reason—even if it brings me pleasure. It's just cruel to do that. Well, you know what else is cruel? Castrating a pig without giving it anesthesia. Or cutting off its tail for no good reason. Yet these are routine practices of factory farms. These farms cause animals a great deal suffering and pain, and not just because animals are killed there (in an often painful and not always quick manner). If that is right, then it would be wrong for me to own a factory farm that does these sorts of things to animals. But if it's wrong for me to do something, it's surely wrong for me to pay someone to do it. And when I purchase meat from a company engaged in factory farming, I am paying that company to produce that meat for me. But it's wrong to produce meat in this way. So it's wrong for me to purchase meat from factory farms.

DUE DATE: SES # 12. Late papers will be penalized.